1	XAVIER BECERRA		
2	Attorney General of California LINDA L. SUN		
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General LISA A. MILLER		
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 281374		
	300 So. Spring Street, Suite 1702		
5	Los Angeles, CA 90013 Telephone: (213) 269-6275		
6 7	Facsimile: (213) 897-2804 E-mail: Lisa.Miller@doj.ca.gov Attorneys for Complainant		
8		ירובויוי יו	
9	BEFORE THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU FOR PRIVATE POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION STATE OF CALIFORNIA		
10	·	1	
11 12	In the Matter of the Statement of Issues Against:	BPPE Case No. 1003079	
13	· ·	OAH Case No.	
	GILIGIA COLLEGE	STATEMENT OF ISSUES	
1415	Renewal for Approval to Operate and Offer Education Programs for Non-Accredited Institutions Applicant		
16	Institution Code: 55199106		
17	Respondent.		
18			
19			
20	Complainant alleges:		
21	<u>PARTIES</u>		
22	1. Dr. Michael Marion, Jr. ("Complainant") brings this Statement of Issues solely in his		
23	official capacity as the Chief of the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education ("Bureau"),		
24	Department of Consumer Affairs.		
25	2. On or about January 12, 2016, the Bureau received an application for a Renewal for		
26	Approval to Operate and Offer Education Programs for Non-Accredited Institutions from Giligia		
27	College ("Respondent"). On or about December 25, 2015, Hovhanes Kartounian certified under		
28			
		1	

REGULATORY PROVISIONS

10. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71400.5, subdivision (a), states:

"The inclusion of false or misleading information, or the intentional or negligent omission of pertinent information on any application may result in the denial of the application or a delay in processing, and may be grounds for action pursuant to Article 18 of the Act."

11. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71405 states:

"(a) If, after the submission of an application but prior to the Bureau's decision to approve or deny an approval to operate, there is any material change in circumstances affecting any information contained in the application or submitted by the institution in support of the application, the institution shall immediately inform the Bureau in writing.

- (b) For the purposes of this section, a change in circumstance is "material" if, without the inclusion of the new or different information into the application, the information contained in or the supporting documentation to the application would be false, misleading, or incomplete."
 - 12. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71475, states in pertinent part:

"(c) The application for renewal of approval to operate and offer educational programs for non-accredited institutions shall include all of the following:

- (1) The name, institution/school code and website address of the institution.
- (2) The physical address of the institution's primary administrative location in California."

"(4) The physical address, phone number and fax number of each campus and branch at which the educational programs will be offered, including the identification of the institution's main location and branch locations."

"(k) The institution shall identify in the application the chief executive officer, chief operating officer, and chief academic officer and describe their education, experience, and qualifications to perform their duties and responsibilities. If there have been no substantive changes since the last submission, the institution may so state and is not required to submit documentation."

...

"(n) The institution shall describe in the application, in detail its mission and objectives. If there have been no substantive changes since the last submission, the institution may so state and is not required to submit documentation."

. . .

"(t) In addition, the institution shall list in the application, the following for each educational program offered unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.

. . .

"(4) The title of the educational programs and other components of instruction offered, including a description of the level of the courses (e.g., below college level, undergraduate level, graduate level);"

...

- "(7) Whether the educational program is designed to fit or prepare students for employment in any occupation. If so, the application shall identify each occupation and job title to which the institution represents the educational program will lead."
- "(x) The application shall include a statement that the institution has contracted with sufficient duly qualified faculty members who meet the qualifications of section 71720 unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation."
- "(y)(1) For each program offered, the application shall contain a description of the facilities and the equipment which is available for use by students at the main, branch, and satellite locations of the institution unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.
- (2) For facilities that are leased or rented, the application shall contain the name and address of the lessor or landlord, together with a copy of any use, lease, or rental agreements for the facilities

unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.

- (3) The application shall include, in addition to the description of the physical facilities, building diagrams or campus maps to assist the Bureau in locating these facilities. The diagrams or maps shall identify the location of classrooms, laboratories, workshops, and libraries unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.
- (4) The description in the application shall include specifications of significant equipment that demonstrate that the equipment meets the standards prescribed by the Code and this chapter and is sufficient to enable students to achieve the educational objectives of each education program unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.
- (5) For each item of significant equipment, the description in the application shall indicate whether the equipment is owned, leased, rented, or licensed for short- or long-term, or owned by another and loaned to be used without charge unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation.
- (6) The application shall contain a list of all permits, certifications, or other evidence of inspections or authorizations to operate required by the jurisdictions within which the institution operates that the institution has obtained, and/or an explanation as to why those permits, certifications, or inspections have not yet been obtained unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation."
- "(aa) If an institution represents to the public, in any manner, that it offers job placement assistance, the application shall include a description of the job placement assistance that it provides unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may so state and is not required to provide documentation."

28 | ///

- 22. On or about May 27, 2016, the Bureau issued a second deficiency letter to Respondent. The letter identified additional deficiencies including changes to the Student Agreements, public statements, catalog, and missing transcripts/certifications for faculty members.
- 23. On or about July 19, 2016, the Bureau issued a third deficiency letter to Respondent, identifying deficiencies including but not limited to the following: inaccurate references to Nursing Assisting/Certified Nursing Assistants; and inadequate curriculum and syllabi for online and classroom programs.
- 24. On or about October 27, 2017, the Bureau issued a Notice of Denial of Application for Renewal of Approval to Operate. The letter listed the basis for the denial which included the following: failure to provide the Bureau with accurate information; submission of falsified School Performance Facts Sheets and/or a falsified resume for Respondent's Chief Operating Officer; submission of inadequate/incorrect information regarding institution objectives, educational programs, faculty continuing education, and faculty credentials; inadequate equipment, instruction, and assistance for students to achieve educational goals; inaccurate descriptions of school facilities; and inadequate record keeping of student information.

FIRST CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Failure to Maintain an Updated Institutional Address)

25. Respondent's application is subject to denial under title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71475, subdivisions (c) (2), and (4), in that Respondent failed to maintain an updated institution's address to the Employment Development Department's training program website, Caljobs, or is operating at a location not approved by the Bureau. Since November 22, 2013, Respondent was only approved to operate at 15643 Sherman Way, Unit 140, in Van Nuys, California. However, Respondent's advertisement on the Caljobs website indicates the institution's primary address is 2361 Florecita Drive in Montrose, California. Institutions that maintain listings on the Caljobs website are required to provide updated information such as location changes. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 19-23, as though set forth fully.

3 4

5

6

7

8 9

10

11

12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21 22

23

24

25

26

27

28

SECOND CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Organization and Management)

Respondent's application is subject to denial under title 5 of the California Code of 26. Regulations, sections 71475, subdivision (k), 71400.5, subdivision (a), and 71730, subdivision (a) in that Respondent's deficiency responses all indicated that A.G. was the Chief Academic Officer for Giligia College. The most recent deficiency response was received by the Bureau on October 14, 2016. However, A.G. informed the Bureau on or about September 17, 2015, that he resigned from Giligia College. The 2017 catalog published on Respondent's website did not identify the institution's Chief Academic Officer, as required by section 94909, subdivision (a)(7). Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 19-23, as though set forth fully.

THIRD CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Chief Operating Officer)

27. Respondent's application is subject to denial under title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 71400.5, subdivision (a), and 71475, subdivision (k) in that Respondent submitted one or more documents with false information in regard to the institution's Chief Operating Officer. Respondent's January 2016 application and deficiency response received by the Bureau in May 2016 both identify Amie G. as the institution's Chief Operating Officer. Respondent provided a resume for Amie G., which indicated that she earned certificates in "Environmental Communication" and "Multimedia Management" in Fall of 2014 from Giligia College. However, the School Performance Fact Sheet submitted to the Bureau for 2014 shows no students as having enrolled in or graduated from either of these programs. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 19-23, as though set forth fully.

FOURTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Mission and Objectives)

28. Respondent's application is subject to denial under section 94885, subdivision (a)(1), and title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 71475, subdivision (n), 71705, 71810, subdivision (b)(2), and 71730, in that the institution's objectives, as stated in the catalog submitted

in October 2016 and posted online (as of October 23, 2017) are inadequate and difficult to comprehend; such that the Bureau is unable to reasonably determine whether the objectives can be applied to measurable student learning outcomes for each educational program. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 19-23, as though set forth fully.

FIFTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Instruction and Degrees Offered

- 29. Respondent's application is subject to denial under title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 71475, subdivisions (t)(4) and (7), 74200, and 71405 in that Respondent's application failed to list the required information for its educational programs including a description of the level of the courses and the occupation and job title, if any, to which the educational programs will lead, as set forth below:
- i. Respondent's description of the "System Administrator/Administrative Assistant" program does not accurately represent the subject matter content and corresponding career outcomes of the program, as it only lists the typical tasks of an Administrative Assistant, not a System Administrator. Furthermore, Respondent's use of the title of "System Administrator" is a misnomer, as the job skills and required training for a system administrator in no way overlap with the training and job skills of an Administrative Assistant.
- ii. Respondent's application does not clearly or consistently present the information relating to the "Medical Billing" program. The program description in the syllabus states that graduates of the program may go on to become "Physician-Based Coders, Hospital Coders, or Medical Claims Reviewers." The title of the program does not correspond to the career outcomes listed in the program description. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 19-23, as though set forth fully.
- iii. Respondent ceased offering the following educational programs to the public: Medical Assisting, Pharmacy Technician, Visual Basic Programmer, Graphic Design, Network Administrator, 3-D Modeling, Computerized Taxing, 3-D Animation and Visual Effects. Respondent removed all of these programs from the institution's website and the current published catalog without informing the Bureau in writing at least 30 days before ceasing to offer the

educational programs to the public. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 19-23, as though set forth fully.

SIXTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Faculty)

- 30. Respondent's application is subject to denial under title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 71720, subdivision (b)(2), in that Respondent failed to demonstrate compliance with the requirement that each instructor shall maintain their knowledge by completing continuing education courses in his or her subject area, classroom management, or other courses related to teaching. When Bureau representatives conducted a site visit on or about April 12, 2017, Respondent did not provide evidence of continuing education in the files which were supplied to the Bureau for review. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 19-23, as though set forth fully.
- 31. Respondent's application is subject to denial under title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 71405, 71475, subdivision (x), and 71700, in that Respondent failed to comply with the requirements relating to faculty qualifications and contracts. Respondent is required to provide the Bureau with documentation demonstrating that it has contracted with sufficiently qualified faculty. Respondent is also required to notify the Bureau of any material changes in circumstances affecting the application. Respondent provided the Bureau with syllabi in 2016, listing the instructors for the various programs offered by Respondent; however, most of these instructors were not listed in the 2017 catalog, as posted on Respondent's website in October 2017. The Bureau was provided with documentation demonstrating appropriate credentials for only four out of seven of Respondent's faculty. Respondent failed to provide the current contracts for all faculty, as requested. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 19-23, as though set forth fully.

SEVENTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Inclusion of False Information Regarding Respondent's Faculty)

32. Respondent's application is subject to denial under title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 71475, subdivision (x), 71400.5, subdivision (a), in that Respondent

submitted resumes of non-employees B.A. and A.G. as part of its January 12, 2016 submission in support of its application, and falsely represented that B.A. and A.G. were faculty members. In fact, A.G. informed the Bureau that he had resigned from Giligia College as of September 17, 2015. When contacted by the Bureau regarding his employment at Giligia College, B.A. informed the Bureau that he had only interviewed for a job at Giligia College but had never been hired. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 19-23, as though set forth fully.

EIGHTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Facilities and Equipment)

- 33. Respondent's application is subject to denial under section 94885, subdivision (a)(3), and title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 71475, subdivision (y), in that Respondent lacks sufficient facilities, instructional equipment, and materials to enable students to achieve the educational program's goals. Bureau representatives visited Respondent's location on or about April 12, 2017, and observed the following missing or inadequate facilities and equipment:
- The Pharmacy Technician Program lacked the following necessary equipment: a sink with running water, a laminar flow hood, materials necessary for aseptic preparation of parenteral products, hazardous substances/sharps disposal equipment, a hazardous substances spill kit, and a cash register.
- Bureau representatives also observed that Web Design Computers are housed in the same small room as the Medical Assisting Equipment and Pharmacy Technology equipment. Pharmacy Technology training requires adequate space to prepare pharmaceuticals and simulate a pharmacy setting for training. Bureau representatives determined that the available space for the Pharmacy Technology program is too cramped and overrun with other programs' equipment to be suitable.
- Bureau representatives observed that the 3D Modeling program does not have equipment sufficient to enable students to achieve educational objectives, as the institution is lacking a 3D camera and 3D printers.

///

28 II /

• Bureau representatives also observed that the Home Care Assistant program does not have equipment sufficient to enable students to achieve educational objectives, as the institution was lacking a wheelchair, transfer belt, simulation lab, full size anatomical models, bed, and bath.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 19-23, as though set forth fully.

NINTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Job Placement Assistance)

34. Respondent's application is subject to denial under section title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 71475, subdivision (aa), that although Respondent's website states that it offers job placement assistance, none of the submitted application materials, including the syllabi or curriculum included a description of the job placement assistance provided, as is required. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 19-23, as though set forth fully.

TENTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Catalog)

35. Respondent's application is subject to denial under title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, sections 71475, subdivision (y), 71400.5, subdivision (a), in that page four of Respondent's 2016 and 2017 catalogs describe the "main campus" as occupying about 2,000 square feet for classroom, a library, a computer laboratory, employee and student lounge with a small kitchen area and administrative offices. This description mischaracterizes the available space. Bureau representatives determined that the suite only occupies 1,171 square feet. Moreover, Bureau representatives determined that the library, computer lab, employee and student lounge and small kitchen are all housed together in one small room. Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 19-23, as though set forth fully.

ELEVENTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Record Keeping – Custodian of Records)

36. Respondent's application is subject to denial under sections 94885, subdivision (a)(8), 94897, subdivision (j), 94900, and title 5 of the California Code of Regulations, section 76140, in

that Respondent failed to adequately maintain student records and submitted false or misleading data to the Bureau as follows:

- Bureau Representative J.M. requested a contact list for currently enrolled students and recent graduates from Respondent. After attempting to contact recent graduates, 47 out of 84 of the email addresses supplied by Respondent were returned as "undeliverable", in most cases because the email address does not exist. The Bureau received a few responses from the Institution's graduates, who indicated that they had graduated from a different program than the one indicated in the Institution's records, or they had not graduated at all.
- Of the 84 students contacted by the Bureau, only one confirmed that that he had graduated from the program identified in Respondent's records.

Complainant refers to, and by this reference incorporates paragraphs 19-23, as though set forth fully.

PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- 1. Denying the application of Giligia College for a Renewal for Approval to Operate and Offer Education Programs for Non-Accredited Institutions;
 - Taking such other and further action as deemed necessary and proper. 2.

DATED:	5/21/18	2-1-l-
	/ /	DR. MICHAEL MARION, JR.

Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education

Department of Consumer Affairs

State of California Complainant

LA2017507569; 52850122.docx