1	XAVIER BECERRA		
2	Attorney General of California ANTOINETTE B. CINCOTTA		
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General DESIREE I. KELLOGG		
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 126461		
5	600 West Broadway, Suite 1800 San Diego, CA 92101		
6	P.O. Box 85266 San Diego, CA 92186-5266		
7	Telephone: (619) 738-9429 Facsimile: (619) 645-2061		
8	Attorneys for Complainant		
9	BEFORE THE		
10	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS FOR THE BUREAU FOR PRIVATE POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION		
11	STATE OF C.	ALIFORNIA	
12	In the Matter of the Statement of Issues	Case No. 1003353	
13	Against:	FIRST AMENDED STATEMENT OF	
14	DAL SMITH MARGARET PATT-SMITH	ISSUES	
15	DBA NATIONAL CULINARY & BAKERY SCHOOL		
16	Applicant for Renewal of Approval to Operate an Institution Non-Accredited		
17	Institution Code 3711241		
18	Respondents.		
19			
20	Complainant alleges:		
21	PARTIES		
22	1. Dr. Michael Marion, Jr. (Complainant) brings this First Amended Statement of Issues		
23	solely in his official capacity as the Chief of the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education,		
24	Department of Consumer Affairs.		
25	2. On January 17, 2003, the Bureau for Private Postsecondary and Vocational Education		
26	issued Dal Smith and Margaret Patt-Smith, doing business as National Culinary & Bakery School		
27	an approval to operate which was valid on June 30, 2007. The Bureau for Private Postsecondary		
28	and Vocational Education sunsetted on July 1, 2007. On October 11, 2009, the Bureau for		

2.7

6. Section 94887 provides:

An approval to operate shall be granted only after an applicant has presented sufficient evidence to the bureau, and the bureau has independently verified the information provided by the applicant through site visits or other methods deemed appropriate by the bureau, that the applicant has the capacity to satisfy the minimum operating standards. The bureau shall deny an application for an approval to operate if the application does not satisfy those standards.

STATUTORY PROVISIONS

7. Section 94909, subdivision (a)(15) provides:

(a) Except as provided in subdivision (d), prior to enrollment, an institution shall provide a prospective student, either in writing or electronically, with a school catalog containing, at a minimum, all of the following:

(15) The following statement:

"NOTICE CONCERNING TRANSFERABILITY OF CREDITS AND CREDENTIALS EARNED AT OUR INSTITUTION

The transferability of credits you earn at (name of institution) is at the complete discretion of an institution to which you may seek to transfer. Acceptance of the (degree, diploma, or certificate) you earn in (name of educational program) is also at the complete discretion of the institution to which you may seek to transfer. If the (credits, diploma, or certificate) that you earn at this institution are not accepted at the institution to which you seek to transfer, you may be required to repeat some or all of your coursework at that institution. For this reason you should make certain that your attendance at this institution will meet your educational goals. This may include contacting an institution to which you seek to transfer after attending (name of institution) to determine if your (credits or degree, diploma, or certificate) will transfer."

8. Section 94911 provides, in part:

An enrollment agreement shall include, at a minimum, all of the following:

- (d) A clear and conspicuous statement that the enrollment agreement is legally binding when signed by the student and accepted by the institution.
- (e) (1) A disclosure with a clear and conspicuous caption, "STUDENT'S RIGHT TO CANCEL," under which it is explained that the student has the right to cancel the enrollment agreement and obtain a refund of the charges paid through attendance at the first class session, or the seventh day after enrollment whichever is later

4	programs for non-accredited institutions shall include all of the following:	
1	111.	
2	(7) The name, title, address, email address, telephone number, nature of interest	
3	and percentage of ownership of each person, as defined in section 94855 of the Code,	
5	who owns or controls 25% or more of the stock or an interest in the institution and, to the extent applicable, each general partner, officer, corporate director, member of the board of directors, and any other person who exercises substantial control over the	
6	institution's management or policies. For the purpose of this paragraph, a person exercises "substantial control over the institution's management or policies" if the person has the authority to cause the institution to expend money or incur debt in the	
7	amount of five thousand dollars (\$5,000) or more in any year.	
8	••••	
9	(e) The institution shall submit at the time it applies for renewal current financial statements that meet the requirements of section 74115 as follows: (1) for an	
10	institution with annual gross revenues of \$500,000 and over, statements shall be audited; (2) for an institution with annual gross revenues less than \$500,000, statements shall be reviewed.	
11	statements shall be leviewed.	
12	(h) The institution shall include in its application the name, title, physical	
13	address, telephone number, fax number, and e-mail address for the agent for service of process in California as required by section 94943.5 of the Code. The agent shall	
14	be at an address other than the address of the institution or any branch. The agent must confirm the information and acknowledge in writing that he or she is the	
15	designated agent for service of process. The information shall be kept current pursuant to section 74190.	
16		
17	(r) The institution shall identify and describe, in the application, the educational program it offers, or proposes to offer. If the educational program is a degree	
18 19	program, the institution shall identify the full title which it will place on each degree awarded. If there have been no substantive changes since the last submission, the institution may so state and is not required to submit documentation.	
20	(t) In addition, the institution shall list in the application, the following for each	
21	educational program offered unless there have been no substantive changes since the last submission. If there have been no substantive changes made the institution may	
22	so state and is not required to provide documentation.	
23		
2425	(4) The title of the educational programs and other components of instruction offered, including a description of the level of the courses (e.g., below college level, undergraduate level, graduate level);	
26		
27	(6) The graduation requirements.	
28		
40	II	

- (6) sequential and detailed outline of subject matter to be addressed or a list of skills to be learned and how those skills are to be measured;
 - (7) instructional mode or methods.
- (d) if degree granting, require research of an appropriate degree that utilizes a library and other learning resources;
- (e) specific learning outcomes tied to the sequence of the presentation of the material to measure the students' learning of the material; and
 - (f) evaluation by duly qualified faculty of those learning outcomes.

14. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71745 provides:

- (a) The institution shall document that it has at all times sufficient assets and financial resources to do all of the following:
- (1) Provide all of the educational programs that the institution represented it would provide.
- (2) Ensure that all students admitted to its educational programs have a reasonable opportunity to complete the programs and obtain their degrees or diplomas.
 - (3) Maintain the minimum standards required by the Act and this chapter.
 - (4) Pay timely refunds as required by Article 13 of the Act.
 - (5) Pay all operating expenses due within 30 days.
- (6) Maintain a ratio of current assets to current liabilities of 1.25 to 1.00 or greater at the end of the most recent fiscal year when using generally accepted accounting principles, or for an institution participating in Title IV of the federal Higher Education Act of 1965, meet the composite score requirements of the U.S. Department of Education. For the purposes of this section, current assets do not include: intangible assets, including goodwill, going concern value, organization expense, startup costs, long-term prepayment of deferred charges, and non-returnable deposits, or state or federal grant or loan funds that are not the property of the institution but are held for future disbursement for the benefit of students. Uncarned tuition shall be accounted for in accordance with general accepted accounting principles.

15. California Code of Regulations, title 5, section 71800 provides, in part:

In addition to the requirements of section 94911 of the Code, an institution shall provide to each student an enrollment agreement that contains at the least the following information:

conspicuous links to all the items required in Section 94913(a) of the Code.

28

BACKGROUND

- 18. On or about January 17, 2003, the Bureau for Private Postsecondary and Vocational Education issued National Culinary & Bakery School an approval to operate which was valid on June 30, 2007. On July 1, 2007, the former Bureau sunsetted. At the time the former Bureau sunsetted, Respondents' approval to operate remained in effect.
- 19. Between July 1, 2007 until January 1, 2010, there was no regulatory body with oversight over private postsecondary educational institutions. Respondents continued to operate during this time. On January 1, 2010, the Bureau was established when the Private Secondary Education Act of 2009 (the Act) became effective.
- 20. Pursuant to the Act, an institution that had a valid approval to operate with the former Bureau on June 30, 2007, could continue to operate for three calendar years after the expiration date of the approval, but was required to comply with the laws governing private postsecondary institutions. Therefore, Respondents were authorized to continue to operate pursuant to its approval to operate and the Act until January 16, 2013.
- 21. On August 1, 2012, the Bureau notified Respondents that if they wished to continue to be approved, an appropriate application needed to be submitted no later than the date of Respondents' expiration of its approval, January 13, 2013. Accordingly, on or about November 3, 2012, Respondents submitted an Application for Renewal of Approval to Operate an Institution Non-Accredited.
- 22. On or about August 25, 2016, the Bureau sent the first letter describing the deficiencies in the application to Respondents. Respondents submitted materials in support of its application and otherwise attempted to correct the deficiencies. On or about April 25, 2017, the Bureau sent Respondents a second letter describing the deficiencies in Respondents' application. Again, Respondents submitted materials and attempted to correct the deficiencies.
- 23. On August 22, 2017, the Bureau sent another letter describing the deficiencies to Respondents and advising that if the application documents do not fall in compliance the application will be recommended for denial. Since the deficiencies were not corrected, the Bureau denied the application on February 16, 2018.

FIRST CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Incomplete Application)
(Educ. Code §§ 94887 and 94943.5; and title 5 Cal. Code Regs., §§ 71475, subd. (c)(7) and 71475, subd. (h))

- 24. Respondents' application is subject to denial because they fail to demonstrate that Respondents have the capacity to satisfy minimum operating standards. ((Educ. Code §§ 94887 and 94943.5; and title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 71475, subd. (c)(7); and 71475, subd. (h)). In particular:
- a. Respondents failed to submit with their application an updated Section 4.1 of Form Application 94891 (rev. 2/10) which would have provided the current ownership structure of Respondents. (title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 71475, subd. (c)(7)).
- b. Respondents failed to submit with their application an updated Section 5 of Form Application 94891 (rev. 2/10) which would have identified the new agent for service of process and his physical address. (Educ. Code § 94943.5 and title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 71475, subd. (h)).

SECOND CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION (Enrollment Agreement)

(Cal. Educ. Code §§ 94877, 94909, subd. (a)(15), 94911, subds. (d), (e)(1), (e)(2), (e)(3), (f), (g)(1), (g)(2), (h), (i)(1), (i)(2), (j)(1), (j)(2), and (k) and 94916); and title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 71800, subd. (e)(11))

- 25. Respondents' application is subject to denial because Respondents failed to submit an enrollment agreement that complies with minimum requirements. (Cal. Educ. Code §§ 94909, subd. (a)(15), 94911, subds. (d), (e)(1), (e)(2), (e)(3), (f), (g)(1), (g)(2), (h), (j)(1), (j)(2), (i)(1), (i)(2) and (k) and 94916; and title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 71800, subd. (e)(11)). In particular:
- a. Respondents' enrollment agreement fails to state the correct amount for the Student Tuition Recovery Fund. (title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 71800, subd. (e)(11)).
- b. Respondents' enrollment agreement fails to include the following disclosures: (1) a clear and conspicuous caption, "STUDENT'S RIGHT TO CANCEL," under which it is explained that the student has the right to cancel and obtain a refund of charges paid through attendance at the first class session, or the seventh day after enrollment, whichever is later; (2) a

statement that, if a student has received federal student financial aid funds, the student is entitled to a refund of moneys not paid from federal student financial aid program funds; and (3) a description of the procedures that a student is required to follow to cancel the enrollment agreement or withdraw from the institution and obtain a refund. (Cal. Educ. Code § 94911, subds. (e)(1), (2) and (3)).

- c. Respondents' enrollment agreement fails to include a statement specifying that, if a student obtains a loan to pay for an educational program, the student will have the responsibility to repay the full amount of the loan plus interest, less the amount of any refund. (Cal. Educ. Code § 94911, subd. (f)).
- d. Respondents' enrollment agreement fails to include a statement specifying that, if a student defaults on a federal or state loan, both the following may occur:
- (1) The federal or state government or a loan guarantee agency may take action against the student, including applying any income tax refund to which the person is entitled to reduce the balance owed on the loan.
- (2) A student may not be eligible for any other federal student financial aid at another institution or other government financial assistance until the loan is repaid.

 (Cal. Educ. Code § 94911, subds. (g)(1) and (2)).
- e. Respondents' enrollment agreement fails to include the transferability disclosure that is required to be included in the school catalog (i.e., "NOTICE CONCERNING TRANSFERABILITY OF CREDITS AND CREDENTIALS EARNED AT OUR INSTITUTION.* The transferability of credits you earn at (insert name of institution) is at the complete discretion of an institution to which you may seek to transfer. Acceptance of the (insert degree, diploma, or certificate) you earn in (insert name of educational program) is also at the complete discretion of the institution to which you may seek to transfer. If the (insert credits or degree, diploma, or certificate) that you earn at this institution are not accepted at the institution to which you seek to transfer, you may be required to repeat some or all of your coursework at that institution. For this reason, you should make certain that your attendance at this institution will meet your educational goals. This may include contacting an institution to which you may

seek to transfer after attending (insert name of institution) to determine if your (insert credits or degree, diploma or certificate) will transfer.") (Cal. Educ. Code §§ 94911, subd. (h) and 94909, subd. (a)(15)).

- f. Respondents' enrollment agreement fails to include the required statements directing a student to the Bureau for unanswered questions and for filing a complaint with the Bureau (i.e., "Any questions a student may have regarding this enrollment agreement that have not been satisfactorily answered by the institution may be directed to the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education at [2535 Capitol Oaks Drive, Suite 400, Sacramento, CA 95833 P.O. Box 980818, West Sacramento, CA 95798-0818, www.bppe.ca.gov, (888) 370-7589 or (916) 263-1897 or by fax (916) 263-1897].* A student or any member of the public may file a complaint about this institution with the Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education by calling (888) 370-7589 toll-free or by completing a complaint form, which can be obtained on the bureau's internet web site www.bppe.ca.gov.") (Cal. Educ. Code § 94911, subds. (j)(1) and (2)).
- g. Respondents' enrollment agreement fails to include the following required statements, with a line for the student to initial: "(1) Prior to signing this enrollment agreement, you must be given a catalog or brochure and a School Performance Fact Sheet, which you are encouraged to review prior to signing this agreement. These documents contain important policies and performance data for this institution. This institution is required to have you sign and date the information included in the School Performance Fact Sheet relating to completion rates, placement rates, license examination passage rates, and salaries or wages, and the most recent three- year cohort default rate, if applicable, prior to signing this agreement."
- (2) Immediately following the statement required by paragraph (1), a line for the student to initial, including the following statement: "I certify that I have received the catalog, School Performance Fact Sheet, and information regarding completion rates, placement rates, license examination passage rates, and salary or wage information, and the most recent three-year cohort default rate, if applicable, included in the School Performance Fact sheet, and have signed, initialed, and dated the information provided in the School Performance Fact Sheet." (Cal. Educ. Code § 94911, subd. (i)(1) and, (i)(2)).

- h. Respondents' enrollment agreement fails to include a clear and conspicuous statement that the enrollment agreement is legally binding when signed by the student and accepted by the institution. (Cal. Educ. Code § 94911, subd. (d)).
- i. Respondents' enrollment agreement fails to include the following specific required statement above the space for the student's signature: "I understand that this is a legally binding contract. My signature below certifies that I have read, understood, and agreed to my rights and responsibilities, and that the institution's cancellation and refund policies have been clearly explained to me." (Cal. Educ. Code § 94911, subd. (k)).
- j. Respondents' enrollment agreement fails to include that an institution extending credit or lending money to an individual for institutional and non institutional charges for an educational program shall cause any note, instrument, or other evidence of indebtedness taken in connection with that extension of credit or loan to be conspicuously marked on its face in at least 12-point type with the following notice: "NOTICE." "YOU MAY ASSERT AGAINST THE HOLDER OF THE PROMISSORY NOTE YOU SIGNED IN ORDER TO FINANCE THE COST OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM ALL OF THE CLAIMS AND DEFENSES THAT YOU COULD ASSERT AGAINST THIS INSTITUTION, UP TO THE AMOUNT YOU HAVE ALREADY PAID UNDER THE PROMISSORY NOTE." (Cal. Educ. Code § 94916).

THIRD CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Instruction and Degrees Offered)
(Educ. Code § 94887; and title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 71475, subds. (r), (t)(4) and (t)(6))

26. Respondents' application is subject to denial because Respondents failed to submit a list of the titles and required educational program lengths for all current educational programs offered by Respondents and may be offering unapproved programs (Educ. Code § 94887; and title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 71475, subds. (r), (t)(4) and (t)(6)).

FOURTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION (Educational Programs)

(Educ. Code § 94887; and title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 71475, subds. (u)(1-6) and 71710 (a)-(f))

27. Respondents' application is subject to denial because Respondents failed to submit
(a) a description of each educational program, (b) the equipment to be used during each
educational program, (c) the number and qualifications of the faculty needed to teach each

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
240

educational program, (d) a projection and the basis for the projection of the number of students that Respondents plans to enroll in each educational program during each of the three years following the date the application was submitted, (e) a description of the learning skills, and other competencies to be acquired by students who complete each educational program; and (f) if licensure is a goal of the educational program, a copy of the approval from the appropriate licensing agency (or a copy of the intent to approve conditional solely upon institutional approval from the Bureau). (Educ. Code § 94887; and title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 71475, subds. (u)(1-6) and 71710, subds. (a)-(f)).

FIFTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION

(Financial Resources)

(Educ. Code § 94887; and title 5 Cal. Code Regs, §§ 71475, subd. (e), 71745, subds. (a)(1-6) and 74115, subds. (a), (b)(1-5), and (d))

28. Respondents' application is subject to denial because Respondent did not submit current and compliant financial statements. (Educ. Code § 94887; and title 5 Cal. Code Regs., §§ 71475, subd. (e), 71745, subds. (a)(1-6) and 74115, subds. (a), (b)(1-5) and (d)).

SIXTH CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF APPLICATION (Institutional Website)

(Educ. Code §§ 94887 and 94913, subds. (a)(2), (a)(4) and (a)(5); and title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 74117)

- 29. Respondents' application is subject to denial because Respondents' website failed to satisfy the minimum operating standards. (Educ. Code §§ 94887 and 94913, subds. (a)(2), (a)(4) and (a)(5) and title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 74117). In particular:
- a. Respondents' website fails to post the School Performance Fact Sheet for each approved educational program offered and an electronic link to the information on Respondents' website. (Educ. Code § 94913, subd. (a)(2); title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 74117.)
- b. Respondents' website fails to clearly and conspicuously, include a link to the Bureau's internet website. (Educ. Code § 94913, subd. (a)(4); title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 74117.)
- c. Respondents' website fails to post its most recent Annual Report and contain an electronic link to the information on Respondents' website. (Educ. Code § 94913, subd. (a)(5); title 5 Cal. Code Regs., § 74117.)

PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Director of the Department of Consumer Affairs issue a decision:

- 1. Denying the application of Dal Smith and Margaret Patt-Smitt, doing business as National Culinary & Bakery School, for a renewal of an approval to operate an institution nonaccredited; and
 - 2. Taking such other and further action as deemed necessary and proper.

Bureau for Private Postsecondary Education Department of Consumer Affairs

State of California Complainant

SD2018700383/71790306.docx